

Chullin – Simanim

פרק ב – השוחט

דף מ – 40 Daf

1. Shechting for the sake of a mountain vs. for the sake of דגא דהר

The next Mishnah states that if one *shechts* לשם הרים – *for the sake of mountains* (i.e., worshipping the mountains), or for the sake of hills, seas, rivers, or deserts, the *shechitah* is invalid. This implies that the *shechitah* is merely פסולה – *invalid*, but not זבחי מתים – “*sacrifices of the dead*,” i.e., forbidden in benefit as an idolatrous sacrifice. But this contradicts another Baraisa which states that if one *shechts* for the sake of mountains, etc., or the sun or the moon, for stars or constellations, for the sake of הגדול השר, מיכאל השר, or even לשום שילשול קטן – *for the sake of a tiny worm*, the animal is prohibited as זבחי מתים! Abaye answered that in the Mishnah’s case, he *shechted* להר – *for the* [sake of] *the mountain* itself, which is a fixed entity and cannot become an object of idolatry (so sacrifices to it are not considered idolatrous sacrifices, although the worshipper incurs the death penalty). [Still, the meat is forbidden in consumption מדרבנן, because it may be confused with idolatrous sacrifices.] The Baraisa’s case is where he *shechted* דהר – *for the sake of the spirit of the mountain*, which is a true object of idolatry, and the animal becomes fully forbidden in benefit.

2. An act of idolatry, even a minimal act of *shechitah*, can prohibit someone else’s animal

Rav Huna says that if someone else’s animal was lying in front of an idol, כיון ששחט בה סימן אחד – *as soon as one cuts one pipe* for idol worship, he prohibits the animal in any benefit as an idolatrous sacrifice. Although designating live animals for idolatrous sacrifices does not prohibit them, performing a physical act of idolatry does. Furthermore, Rav Huna holds like Rebbe Yochanan, who said: אסרה – *even though they said that one who bows to his fellow’s animal does not prohibit it*, because one cannot prohibit another person’s property, עשה בה מעשה אסרה – *if he does an act of idolatry in it, he does prohibit it*. Rashi adds that Rav Huna is teaching that even a minimal act is sufficient, and even cutting half a סימן would prohibit it. The Gemara later relates that Rav Nachman, Rav Amram, and Rav Yitzchak disagree and say אין אדם אוסר דבר שאין שלו – *a person cannot prohibit something that is not his*, even through a complete act of *shechitah* for idolatry.

3. Shechting *kodashim* on Shabbos בחוץ for idolatry

Rav Huna is challenged from a Baraisa teaching that if one *shechts* חטאת on Shabbos, בחוץ – *outside* the Mikdash, for the sake of *avodah zarah*, he is liable for three חטאות for these three transgressions. According to Rav Huna, that the animal becomes forbidden as soon as he cuts a single סימן, he should not be liable for *shechting korbanos* בחוץ, because once the animal is forbidden in benefit, מחתך בעפר הוא – *cutting the second סימן is the equivalent of merely cutting earth*, and not *shechitah*! Even if we say the Baraisa is discussing חטאת העוף, which only requires cutting one סימן, Rav Huna holds even a minimal act for idolatry prohibits it, so the initial cut will still prohibit it before most of the first סימן is cut, and he should not be liable for *shechting* בחוץ! Mar Zutra ultimately answers that the Baraisa’s case is חצי קנה פגום – *where half the trachea of the חטאת העוף was already [severed]*, and he added the slightest cut, thus completing the *shechitah*, דבולהו בהדי קאתיין – *whereby all of them (the shechitah on Shabbos, the shechitah בחוץ, and the shechitah for idolatry) occurred simultaneously*.

Siman – Pool (מים)

At the mountain **pool** where one man *shechted* his animal toward the mountain לשם הרים, *passing the shechitah but not making the animal זבחי מתים*, and another man *shechted* even less than half a siman of a friend’s sheep lying in front of an idol prohibiting it completely, children tried to dive over an inflatable shaped like a man *shechting* חטאת העוף on Shabbos, בחוץ for the sake of עבודה זרה to win three חטאות medals.

דף מ | DAF 40

Pool



At the mountain pool where one man *shechted* his animal toward the mountain לשם הרים, *passing the shechitah* but not making the animal זבחי מתים, and another man *shechted* even less than half a *siman* of a friend's sheep lying in front of an idol prohibiting it completely, children tried to dive over an inflatable shaped like a man *shechting* a בחוץ, on Shabbos חטאת for the sake of עבודה זרה to win three חטאת medals.

3 things to remember

1. *Shechting* for the sake of a mountain vs. for the sake of גדא דהר
2. An act of idolatry, even a minimal act of *shechitah*, can prohibit someone else's animal
3. *Shechting kodashim* on Shabbos בחוץ for idolatry

